

1 Robert A. Sacks (CSB No. 150146)  
2 (sacksr@sullcrom.com)  
3 SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP  
4 1888 Century Park East, Suite 2100  
5 Los Angeles, California 90067  
6 (310) 712-6600 (telephone)  
7 (310) 712-8800 (facsimile)

5 Laura Kabler Oswell (SBN 241281)  
(oswell@sullcrom.com)  
6 SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP  
7 1870 Embarcadero Road  
Palo Alto, California 94303  
Telephone: (650) 461-5600  
8 Facsimile: (650) 461-5700

9 Attorneys for Intervenor Thomson  
Consumer Electronics, Inc.

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

## SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

IN RE: CATHODE RAY TUBE (CRT) ) Case No. 07-5944-SC  
ANTITRUST LITIGATION )  
 ) MDL No. 1917

This Document Relates to:  
ALL INDIRECT PURCHASER ACTIONS.

) )  
RECOMMENDATION GRANTING  
MOTION OF THOMSON CONSUMER  
ELECTRONICS, INC. TO INTERVENE

) )  
Date: September 27, 2012  
Time: 1:00 p.m.  
JAMS: Two Embarcadero Center, Suite 1500  
Judge: Hon. Samuel Conti  
Special Master: Hon. Charles A. Legge (Ret.)

**[PROPOSED] REPORT AND  
RECOMMENDATION GRANTING  
MOTION OF THOMSON CONSUMER  
ELECTRONICS, INC. TO INTERVENE**

Date: September 27, 2012  
Time: 1:00 p.m.  
JAMS: Two Embarcadero Center, Suite 1500  
Judge: Hon. Samuel Conti  
Special Master: Hon. Charles A. Legge (Ret.)

[MOTION TO INTERVENE; ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION TO SHORTEN TIME; AND DECLARATION OF LAURA KABLER OSWELL IN SUPPORT OF ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION; FILED CONCURRENTLY HEREWITH]

1 To the Honorable Samuel Conti, United States District Judge:

2 On September 14, 2012, Intervenor Thomson Consumer Electronics, Inc. ("Thomson  
3 Consumer") filed its Motion to Intervene. In the Motion to Intervene, Thomson Consumer seeks the  
4 Court's permission to intervene in the above-titled action for the limited purpose of opposing the  
5 Indirect Purchaser Plaintiffs' ("Plaintiffs") Motion for Leave to Amend Complaint (Dkt. No. 1325),  
6 which proposes to add Thomson Consumer as a defendant in this action.

7 Having carefully considered the briefs and other submissions of the parties, as well as  
8 oral arguments by counsel at the hearing, the Special Master recommends that the Motion to Intervene  
9 should be GRANTED.

10  
11 DATED: \_\_\_\_\_

12 Hon. Charles A. Legge  
13 United States District Judge (Ret.)  
14 Special Master

15 The Report and Recommendations are Accepted and Ordered / Denied / Modified.

16 DATED: \_\_\_\_\_

17 Hon. Samuel Conti  
18 United States District Judge